and we are taking up more and more areas for this purpose.

SHRIMATI VEENA VERMA: May I know from the hon. Minister whether Government has received a detailed scheme from ONGC for the use of compressed natural gas in place of petrol and diesel? If so, what is the Government's reaction to this scheme and whether Government is going to enforce it?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Yes, Sir, we have a report from the ONGC and we have our own study made in this regard. But before I go into that, may I just add because I forgot to give one information to the previous questioner. He said that our petroleum prices are costlier comparatively. It is not so. There are countries where the petroleum prices are more than in India. So what he has said in not correct.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now you come to her question.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Coming to her question, Sir it is true and we are making a study of this. We are looking for alternative fuels. One alternative fuel is gas, utilisation of gas for various uses. The compressed natural gas (CNG) can be used in vehicles also. That is being tried and we have been trying it. But even countries which tried this are not fully successful. For instance, in Brazil, Netherland, New Zealand, they are experimenting. We are also experimenting. So I take your suggestion, it is a very valuable suggestion and we are looking into this very seriously.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 142. Absent. Question No. 143.

(Q. No. 142—hon. Members absent)

[*The Questioners Shri Ashwani Kumar and Atal Bihari Vajpayee were*

Inquiry Committee report on aircrash at Ahmedabad

*143. KUMARI SAYEEDA KHATUN:†
SHRI KAPIL VERMA :

Will the Minister of CIVIL AVIATION be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government have received the report of the Inquiry committee which conducted a porbe in to the aircrash at Ahmedabad; if so, what are the finidngs there of; and

(b) what follow up measures have been taken by Government?

THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING AND PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI P. UPENDRA): (a) The report of the Court of Inquiry which investigated the Ahmedagad aircrash has been received. The cause of the accident is "error on the part of the pilot-in-command as well as co-pilot due to non-adherence to laid down procedures under poor visibility conditions."

(b) Government has accepted the recommendations which are aimed at enhancing the safety of aircraft operations.

कुमारी सईदा खातून : सभापति जी, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहती हूं कि जो प्रश्न है उसमें पूछा गया है कि क्या अहमदाबाद में हुई विमान दुर्घटना के संबंध में जांच न्यायालय की रिपोर्ट प्राप्त हो गई है, यदि हां, तो उसमें कौन कौन से मुद्दे उठाए गए हैं और उस रिपोर्ट को लागू किस हद तक किया गया है ताकि आइन्दा ऐसी दुर्घटनाएं न हों, इस पर क्या रोशनी डाली गई है इस बारे में बताएंगे ?

†The Question was actually asked on the floor of the House by

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Sir, the Court of Inquiry discussed the accident and their findings are about 17.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You place them on the Table of the House.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Nineteen causes were mentioned, but they had also suggested 27 items for implementation. The Government has already implemented about 16 of them. One or two were found to be difficult for implementation, but others are in the process of being implemented. If the honourable Member wants, I can read out all the 27 items.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You lay them on the Table of the House.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Yes, Sir.

कुमारी सईदा खातून : महोदय, ये मुद्दे तो लिखित में हमारे पास आने चाहिए थे, उसमें मुद्दे देने चाहिए थे।

मेरा दूसरा सप्लीमेंटरी यह है कि क्या आपने इन सिफारिशों को स्वीकार कर लिया है जिनका उद्देश्य परिचालकों की सुरक्षा में सुधार करना है ? इसमें आपने दृश्यता की खराबी बताया है। तो क्या दृश्यता की खराबी थी या वातावरण की खराबी थी या आपके इंस्ट्रूमैंट खराब थे, किस वजह से यह विमान दुघटना हुई, यह मैं जानना चाहती हूं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: What are the causes?

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Sir, the main finding was that the instrument landing system was not operational at that time and there were no approach lights. These were the main reasons they found for poor visibility and for exceeding the runway. But there are 27 suggestions given, and I can send a statement to her--what are that have been accepted and what are being implemented.

SHRI KAPIL VERMA: Sir, the report is very shocking and the Minister has put a lid on it. The report has clearly charged the National Airports Authority of India with failing to discharge their statutory duty of providing proper radio navigational aids and meteorological information at the Ahmedabad airport. Periodical calbiration of these instruments was also not done at the airport. The report said that the Indian Airlines was also guilty of omission since they did not insist upon the NAAI to provide the above facilities. Apart from that, Sir, the Co-pilot was not experienced enough, the apparatus of the air traffic control to give data was highly unsatisfactory, the airport approach lights were not working properly and even the fire-fighting services were not properly working. So, I want a specific answer whether they fixed the responsibility and what action has been taken in this matter and which recommendations they have actually accepted, particularly, about calibration, meteorological data and other facts that have come to light. I want a specific answer.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Sir, whatever the honourable Member has said is correct: As far as the findings are concerned, they did blame the National Airports Authority for not providing certain facilities, and also the Indian Air lines for not insisting on them, and said that there should be better coordination. We have taker certain steps for achieving this coordi nation. As far as the other suggestions are concerned, I can mention one or two. They said that the approach lights at Ahmedabad should be immediately made serviceable. They have been made serviceable now. "The instrument landing system should be commissioned at Ahmedabad airport forthwith."

SHRI KAPIL VERMA: It is there but it is not working.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: The instrument landing system has been com missioned. Therefore, Sir, whatever operational facilities have to be provided, have been provided. About fixing of responsibility, etc., we are

taking certain action for better coordination.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Government is trying to see that none of these things fail in future.

SHRI KAPIL VERMA: There is no coordination. What action has been taken against those guilty people? It has resulted in the death of 165 people and the Government is impervious to it.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Sir, the court of Inquiry's report clearly said, "The error on the part of the Pilot-in-command as well as the Co-Pilot..." and I can't punish them *post mortem.*

SHRI KAPIL VERMA: No, but the defects which they have pointed out..... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Sir, I have said that the Government has taken steps for better coordination between the Airports Authority and the Indian Airlines.

SHRI KAPIL VERMA: How many have been suspended?

SHRI P. UPENDRA: The facilities suggested have already been provided. About punishing them, they are not there. Whom do we punish now?

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI: Mr. Chairman, through you I would like to ask the Minister, while the Ahmedabad crash report has been tabled, what is holding the Guwahati crash report. The various recommendations of enquiry committees and the Inspector of Accidents on so many crashes in the past, it has been seen, never get implemented in their totality. For example, the hon. Minister just mentioned that the approach light, they said, should be made serviceable, and it has been made serviceable. I don't even think that it should go to the Inspector of Accidents to say that lights need to be serviceable. *(Interruptions)* Obviously it should work.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your question now?

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI: The question is whether the Government is considering setting up a committee which would look into the various recommendations of committees on various crashes and give a report on how far they have been implemented. I know from the media that a Senior Examiner based in the eastern region has been violating all safety norms day in and day out in broad day light. He was also involved in a near mid-air miss. But, unfortunately, no action has been taken. So, my question to the Minister is whether the Director-General of Civil Aviation will take notice of such lapses and whether a committee would be set up to look into the implementation of various accident reports.

Thank you.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Sir, I have already said that as far as this accident is concerned, the follow-up action has been taken. This is a general question regarding the accident and the safety operations. Safety is a subject which is receiving constant attention of the Government. The DGCA is there to look after this job. I don't think any special committee is required for this purpose.

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI: I asked about the implementation of the various recommendations made by the committee which goes into crashes.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: It is the job of the Government. The Government is implementing the suggestions.

MR. CHAIRMAN: About Ahmedabad he has said. Shri Suresh Kalmadi.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Sir, the statement is most surprising. On the one hand it is a fashion these days to blame the pilot and the co-pilot who

are dead. On the other hand, it is not there in the reply, but he says clearly that the ILS was not functioning. How can it be the fault of the pilot if the ILS which was needed for him in bad visibility, was not functioning? How can you blame the pilot and the co-pilot? Just because they are dead and gone, the blame is fixed on the pilot and the co-pilot, and no blame is fixed on the instrument landing system. Why was the instrument landing system which is so essential in bad weather, not operational? I am very surprised, Sir. I would like to have clarifications from the Minister on this one point.

Also, as you said just now, out of the 27 recommendations, two you are finding very difficult to implement. I would like to know which of these two you are finding difficult to implement.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: A few.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: He says, "a few".

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Which are the difficult ones? I would like to know which are the few ones. If the court of enquiry has stated that 26 things need to be done, the Minister says that a few of these cannot be implemented. I would like to know which of them cannot be implemented.

The Airbus 320 is supposed to be landing in Ahmedabad. What facilities have been created for that? When is the Airbus going to take off? You have spent Rs. 50 lakhs on advertisements saying that the Airbus is going to take off to Ahmedabad. What has happened? Why has the Airbus not resumed after the advertisements have been given? Rs. 50 lakhs has been spent. Why has the Airbus not resumed as yet?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Few or a few?

MR. CHAIRMAN: The instrument landing system was not working. Have you taken any action on this?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: My hon. friend knows so much. He must be aware that a few findings were against the pilot and the co-pilot themselves. They disregarded certain basic safety norms. I don't want to blame them now. It is unnecessary to go into this subject now. The court of enquiry has blamed them also for not following certain safety precautions.

As far as the Ahmedabad Airport is concerned, the Airport.....

MR. CHAIRMAN: The report says about the failure of the instrument landing system. Have you taken any action against those who are responsible for this?

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Yes, that I have said. As far as the facilities are concerned, hey have already been provided now. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI KAPIL VERMA: It was there. It was not working.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Sir, I cannot answer for the failure of their Government which did not function for 42 years. What can I do? It happened in their time. I cannot be blamed for that.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: You can punish the person in the previous Government, who is responsible.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Yes. As far as fixing the responsibility for these lapses is concerned, that is in progress now.

As far as the Ahmedabad Airport is conconed,....

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: He is a substitute. How can he reply to all the details?

SHRI P. UPENDRA: I will reply to whatever is reasonable. But, if you ask me to account for the failure of the previous Government, I cannot do so.

The airfield has been upgraded with the ILS facility and the approach landing system. The runway has been extended to 7,500 feet, and it is being further extended to 9,000 feet. The Airport itself is being upgraded with a cost of Rs. 15 crores to Rs 16 crores so that the Airbus can land there. By 1991 the Airbus will land there.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: How can they land? The Airbus is not taking off. When is it taking off?

SHRI P.UPENDRA: In 1991 the Airbus will land there.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: When will they take off? How can they land without taking off?

Rs. 200 crores have already been wasted on the Airbus. They are near the hangars, in god-forsaken places in the Airport. When they age going to start operation, I want to know. So much of travelling public is being inconvenienced today. Let the Government today stand up. They said that the Airbus would take off. But why has it not taken off? What is the difficulty? Why did you make the announcement? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI A.G. KULKARNI: I want to add one sentence.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: The Civil Aviation Minister has already made a statement on Airbus 320 and its operation. That is a different question now.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: There is a difference of opinion between your Ministry and the PMO. That is why it is not taking off. How is the Government working? Sir, the PMO is not permitting, while the Minister wants to run them. What is the difference of opinion? (*Interruptions*) There is a difference of opinion between the PMO and the Ministry. That is why you can not take a decision. That is correct.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: I won't answer that.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: I have answered it.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: The Minister's reply is very pathetic. I feel that the people who are alive to service the Airport and the Government are more responsible for this tragic accident than the people who are dead. It was said that the instrument landing system was not working I would like to know in cases where the instrument landing system is not working or there is no instrument landing system because in many other airports there is no ILS, in case of inclement weather what the procedure is of guiding the pilot. Did the control tower of the Ahmedabad Airport warn the pilot not to land or divert the aircraft to any other airport? Otherwise, only by blaming the dead man the problem is not solved. What was the fault of the control tower? Did they take precaution in the inclement weather? Whether they cautioned the pilot, I would like to know from the Minister.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Sir, the ILS was functioning with limitation. The procedure in such cases was in vogue. But the pilot descended below 500 feet at that time which he should not have done. That was the main cause. The enquiry report also said the same thing. He should not have come down below 500 feet.

मंत्रालयों को डीजल की खपत को कम करने के बारे में आदेश

*144. श्री अनन्त राम जायसवाल : क्या पैट्रोलियम और रसायन मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि :

(क) क्या उनके मंत्रालय ने रेलवे मंत्रालय को डीजल की खपत को 20